

**California Road Charge Pilot Program Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)
Minutes
September 16, 2015**

**Red Lion Hotel
Evergreen Room
1929 Fourth Street
Eureka, CA**

www.CaliforniaRoadChargePilot.com

1. Roll Call

Jim Madaffer, Chair, convened the meeting of the Road Charge Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) at 11:00 AM. Anne Johnson, staff of the California Transportation Commission (CTC), conducted roll call.

| | | | |
|---------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------|
| Chair Jim Madaffer | Present | Richard Marcantonio | Absent |
| Lisa Bartlett | Present | Pam O'Connor | Present |
| Senator Jim Beall | Absent | Eshwar Pittampalli | Present |
| Assemblymember David Chiu | Absent | Robert Poythress | Absent |
| David Finigan | Arrived at 11:38 am | Eric Sauer | Present |
| Stephen Finnegan | Absent | Lee Tien | Present |
| Gautam Hans | Present | Martin Wachs | Present |
| Loren Kaye | Present | | |

Chair Madaffer provided a reminder that public comments are welcomed throughout the meeting.

Charlie Fielder, District 1 Director of Caltrans, welcomed the TAC to the North Coast.

Susan Bransen, Chief Deputy Director of CTC, announced that Carrie Pourvahidi has accepted a position at Caltrans as the Road Charge Pilot Program Manager. She will continue to support the CTC with the road charge efforts through December 2015 when the TAC's recommendations report on the design of the pilot program will be submitted to CalSTA.

2. Public Comment

Barbara Kennedy, Coalition for Responsible Transportation Priorities (CRTP), provided the following comments:

- CRTP supports responsible revenue raising to ensure that existing infrastructure is maintained and repaired as necessary.
- CRTP has concerns about moving away from a gas tax and thus removing the disincentive for fossil fuel use in transportation.
- CRTP believes that a road charge unfairly penalizes people living in rural areas, such as the North Coast. Residents of the North Coast have made personal efforts to use electric or alternative-fuel vehicles to address the problems of fossil fuel use.
- CRTP believes the state needs to stop or dramatically scale back the building of new infrastructure that will require more extensive maintenance and repair and focus instead on repairing and maintaining the infrastructure we already have.

- When we do build new transportation infrastructure, we must consider which types of users that infrastructure is designed to support.

3. Approval of Minutes for August 26, 2015

Chair Madaffer made note of correction to Agenda Item 4, TAC Member Reports, to state *San Diego Union-Tribune*.

Motion: Sauer

Second: Bartlett

Action Taken: Approved

Vote Result: 9-0

Ayes: Bartlett, Hans, Kaye, Madaffer, O'Connor, Pittampalli, Sauer, Tien, Wachs

Nays: None

Absent: Beall, Chiu, Finigan, Finnegan, Marcantonio, Poythress

4. TAC Member Reports

TAC members reported the following speaking/attendance engagements throughout the past month:

- Supervisor Bartlett, along with several members of the TAC, attended the Mobility 21 Summit in Anaheim. There was a breakout session that was very well attended, and due to the many questions from the audience, not all the questions were answered during that time but were answered subsequent to the conference in a Q&A format. The Q&A's will be posted on the Road Charge website.
- Chair Madaffer also reported on the Mobility 21 Summit panel discussion that included Supervisor Bartlett, Mr. Sauer, and Mr. Finnegan. The panel received many questions that will also be posted on the Road Charge website in the form of an FAQ.
- Chair Madaffer and Norma Ortega, Chief Financial Officer of Caltrans, participated on the "Paying by the Mile" panel at the American Public Works Association Congress held in Phoenix, Arizona.

5. Actions/Updates of On-Going Work

a. TAC Recommendations Report

Carrie Pourvahidi, Caltrans, provided an update on the Road Charge Pilot Design Recommendations Report Outline (click [here](#) for a link to the outline of the Recommendations Report).

b. Focus Groups and Survey Update

Gary Gutierrez, Caltrans, provided an informational progress update on efforts to gather road charge baseline data through focus groups and telephone surveys (click [here](#) for a link to the memorandum).

CTC and Caltrans staff will expedite the telephone survey summary development to provide the summary to the TAC members prior to the October meeting.

6. Workgroup Update

Carrie Pourvahidi, Caltrans, provided an update of the Workgroup's efforts (click [here](#) for a link to the memorandum and an updated Workgroup roster).

The Workgroup last met on September 10, 2015 to discuss policy matters that the TAC is considering at today's meeting.

Supervisor Bartlett suggested contacting the Transportation Corridor Agencies, to inquire how they handle customer service, in particular the violations and enforcement aspects since they are very well in tuned with toll violations.

7. Informational Reports

a. Response to August TAC Questions

Gary Gutierrez, Caltrans, provided an informational memorandum to the TAC in response to the follow-up questions from the August TAC meeting (click [here](#) for a link to the memorandum).

b. Website Update

Brady Tacdol, Caltrans, provided an update on the [Website](#) statistics. The website has a new carousel entitled "What's New with Road Charge?" on the homepage. There is also a new tool for the public to view archived TAC meetings. The social media sharing links are on the website and TAC members are encouraged to share these links. There are now 34 states and 16 countries who have shown interest in the website.

Professor Wachs asked how the volunteers are being engaged and what is the process for those expressing interest to continue to be involved and remain interested in being a volunteer.

Mr. Tacdol responded that the project team is in the process of sending follow-up correspondence to re-engage the volunteers by the end of the month.

Ms. Ortega stated that the project team is working on a plan to recruit volunteers. With the assistance of transportation partners and the TAC members, we can encourage people to sign up to be volunteers.

8. Pilot Participant Experience and Review of TAC Design Recommendations

Jeff Doyle and Travis Dunn, D'Artagnan Consulting, provided a presentation of the pilot participant experience and review of the TAC design recommendations (click [here](#) for a link to the presentation).

1. Operational concepts
2. Review of TAC recommendations to date
3. Enforcement approach
4. Payment simulation approach

Chair Madaffer recommended that there should be a discussion on where to move the decision points on the list; not necessarily by chronological order of when the decisions were made, but by the importance from the community and public comments. Specifically Chair Madaffer recommended the privacy and data security provisions be at the top of the list.

During the summary of the TAC decision recommendations presentation, there were discussions on:

- Revenue as an evaluation criteria
- Open system
- Invoicing options

During the walk-through of the pilot program based on the TAC design recommendations presentation, there were discussions on:

- Fuel tax refunds
- Mileage reporting requirements
- Pricing approach for time permits
- Options for volunteers to have reporting methods selected for them
- Self-reporting (mileage exemptions – automated and manual options)
- Fraud from a refund claims program
- Time permits – testing shorter renewal periods during the pilot
- Procedures for enforcing violations against a commercial account manager

Based on the walk-through and TAC discussion of the pilot program policy questions, the following actions were taken by the TAC:

1. *Should the pre-pay odometer charge operational concept be removed?*

Options:

1. *Retain both pre-pay odometer charge and mileage permit concepts*
2. *Remove the pre-pay odometer charge concept only*
3. *Remove the mileage permit concept only*

Staff recommended that the pre-pay odometer charge operational concept be removed.

Motion: Tien

Second: Kaye

Action Taken: Approved

Vote Result: 10-0

Ayes: Bartlett, Finigan, Hans, Kaye, Madaffer, O'Connor, Pittampalli, Sauer, Tien, Wachs

Nays: None

Absent: Beall, Chiu, Finnegan, Marcantonio, Poythress

2. *Should “other location-based devices”, as introduced and described in March, be added to the array of technologies recommended in the pilot test?*

At the April TAC meeting, this category of technologies was not recommended for approval. For trucks volunteering for the pilot, this category of technology is necessary to allow automated measuring and reporting of mileage.

- Decision Point #2: Reporting method choice
 - ✓ Look into allowing drivers the option for an “assign me” alternative when signing up for the pilot.
 - ✓ Acknowledgement that the TAC decided to remove the pre-pay odometer charge operational concept.
- Decision Point #6: Diverse vehicle ownership types
 - ✓ Acknowledgment that the TAC decided to allow trucks volunteering for the pilot to choose mileage reporting devices previously eliminated by the TAC.
- Decision Point #8: Mileage exemptions
 - ✓ Clarify the use of “refunds” and “exemptions” terminology and consider what the practical differences would be from the driver’s perspective rather than just the government’s perspective.
- Decision Point #9: Privacy protections
 - ✓ Provide information on who might have legal standing to compel the state to adhere or observe the privacy protection measures that might be enacted in the future.

9. Review of Action Items, Outstanding Parking Lot Issues, Next Steps and Other Matters

Jeff Doyle, D’Artagnan Consulting, went through the list of action items to include before or at the October TAC meeting, outstanding parking lot issues, and potential decisions for the October TAC meeting.

Action Items/Parking Lot Issues:

1. Provide telephone survey results to the TAC members before the next meeting.
2. Contact the Transportation Corridor Agencies and inquire how their customer service staff handles customer service.
3. Report back to the TAC with more information about what the flat rate price would be for a time permit.
4. Consider an option for pilot volunteers expressing willingness to have an operational concept assigned to them.
5. Clarify the use of “refunds” and “exemptions” terminology and consider the practical differences from the driver’s perspective.
6. Research if there is information available on fraud rates for the gas tax refund process.
7. Ensure privacy protection measures are drafted in a way that provides legal standing for private citizens to compel government to adhere to those privacy protection measures.

10. Public Comment

No comments from the public were made for this agenda item.

11. Adjourn

Next TAC meeting will be on Friday, October 23, 2015 in Oakland, CA.

Meeting adjourned at 2:30 pm.